

### Deliverable Number 14:

Report on Societal Implications

Project Funding



RTD Partners



**University of Brighton**



Univerzita Karlova v Praze  
Charles University in Prague

CSO Partners



## Introduction:

This report presents a brief but complete picture of the ESDinds project's societal implications and lessons learned throughout the implementation of the project. This report draws from activities carried out over the first three phases of the project, including discussions within the Consortium, the evolving roles of consortium members and field visits carried out between January and August 2010. This also includes a consideration of gender and faith balance issues within these different domains.

For the purpose of this report, societal implications are defined as the ways in which socio-cultural contexts have influenced certain aspects of the project, as well as the project's social impacts. This two-way definition is useful as it provides a simple framework to understand the complex interaction between the project, its outcomes and society.

This report presents examples of actual lessons learned and impacts of the ESDinds project at different levels, also drawing out anticipated future impacts. The evidence used in this report is drawn from consortium discussions and evolving roles and responsibilities of consortium partners (recorded in the Consortium General Meeting minutes), project outputs and the recorded outcomes and benefits of project evaluation trials carried out during the field visits. The latter information was gathered *post-facto* for the first set of field visits and incorporated into the data gathering processes of the second set of field visits due to the invaluable insight this information has provided. When presenting this evidence, this report starts from the premise that any impact, whether it be at the level of the individuals involved, interpersonal relationships or collective impacts, is important. Indeed, these different levels of impact are often interconnected and can all have social implications and lead to positive social impacts (see Henry & Mark 2003).

The report presents societal implications in two main sections. The first focuses on ESDinds as a project, including Consortium members, project and research design. The second part presents evidence gathered from the field visits, focusing on the evaluation tools and methods developed in the ESDinds project and tested in five different organisations.

## Social Implications and the ESDinds project

### *Co-design*

Co-design has been a central element of the ESDinds project from the outset. The initial design of the project was very innovative in terms of the role given to CSO (Civil Society Organisation) partners within the Consortium. This led to several challenges, especially administrative and financial, at the outset of the project. The social implications of this initial project design are apparent: the project is challenging the vision of research institutions as the experts and CSOs as the 'receivers' by recognising that both types of partners have expertise, albeit in different areas. More concretely, this innovative project design led the EU to invite Prof. Marie Harder to give a talk about the challenges of implementing such a project within the current administrative and financial structures of European research grants, thus making it easier for future such projects to be funded and carried out (Harder 2009a). Prof. Harder also spoke on the topic at a UK Design Conference (Harder 2009b) and intends to publish an academic paper on this topic.

During the project, co-design has had an important impact on the project outcomes. While partner research institutions have focused on making the research process as rigorous as possible, input from CSO partners has been crucial in order to make sure that the project outputs were as useful as possible, before even going into the field. This focus on the usefulness of project outputs has also meant that these have been more ambitious than originally intended. This led to a repeated visit to the University of Guanajuato in a subsequent phase in an effort to test whether the indicators could be applied at an institutional level, but also to enable the organisation to continue doing the evaluation 'on their own'.

### *Engagement and collaboration*

The highly collaborative nature of the project and deep engagement of all Consortium partners also has important social implications. One of the project partners, the European Bahá'í Business Forum (EBBF), has chosen to employ their own project manager for ESDinds applications within EBBF, dedicating organisational resources which will enable them to move forward with the work beyond the end of the ESDinds project in January 2011, thus providing the opportunity for their member organisations to continue to use and further develop the values-based evaluation systems developed in ESDinds. Furthermore, the deep involvement of the Consortium member from the Earth Charter Initiative (ECI) has led the organisation to acquire the capacity to advise their affiliates on using the ESDinds indicators and assessment tools, and become committed to using them with their affiliates and related projects. ECI's full participation in the project also led their representative in the Consortium to trial the indicators with the Earth Charter's online course, e-GLO, which involves over twenty participants from all over the globe.

Thus, the implications of this engagement from both ECI and EBBF are potentially huge as both are umbrella organisations that can directly influence projects and business practices around the world: ECI affiliates, youth groups and projects are present in over 80 countries and EBBF have 20 national representatives in key areas across Europe and the USA, and over 600 individual members (ECI annual report 2009; EBBF annual report 2009).

EBBF's engagement with the project was also crucial in facilitating a partnership with a socially responsible marketing company who were instrumental in envisioning the potential for a much wider impact than the project partners anticipated. Translating the evaluation methods and assessment tools developed into a free and accessible web-platform ([www.wevalue.org](http://www.wevalue.org)) means that we are anticipating input from around the world and communicating our research findings to networks that our project dissemination efforts might not have accessed so successfully. These are still early days for the 'We Value' website, but the platform will remain live after the end of the project, increasing the potential impacts of the ESDinds project.

### *Diversity, faith and gender*

The diversity of individuals involved in the project has been important in several ways. Firstly, this means that the project has had input from a variety of individuals with different social and cultural backgrounds. At each Consortium General Meeting (CGM), the group openly discussed issues of faith-balance and gender occurring in the project implementation and design. The Consortium did not identify any instances of discrimination, faith imbalance or gender issues to date (see notes from CGM1, 2 & 3).

The mixture of researchers' backgrounds was important in terms of research design and implementation. Although the primary data collection may have some European bias due to the nature of the project, data was collected from people from broad cultural and faith backgrounds, and several individuals from projects across the world were interviewed. Further, this diversity meant that the identification and development of indicators was not influenced by one or more faiths. The Consortium agreed at CGM2 that the indicators developed thus far were faith neutral, and possibly over-leaning toward secular, and that testing them in a faith context as well as different cultural contexts would be important in order to see if they are more widely relevant.

Furthermore, the Consortium actively sought to include as many socially and culturally diverse groups as possible in the field visits. In the first field phase, four out of the five organisations visited were youth groups, so the focus in the second field phase has shifted to businesses, larger organisations and groups involving adults rather than youth. The cultural and social diversity within the Consortium has also facilitated field visits to be carried out in linguistically and culturally diverse settings; projects visited to date were based in Germany, Luxemburg, Hungary, Austria, Italy, Switzerland, Mexico and Sierra Leone.

The list is by no means comprehensive and much work still needs to be done in order to address the challenges of understanding the relevance of the values-based indicators developed in the ESDinds project in different contexts. Indeed, the Consortium has found it challenging so far to include a faith-based organisation in the field testing phase. The issue was brought up at Core Group Meeting 3, where the Consortium identified, with insight from the Alliance for Religions and Conservation (ARC), that many faith-based organisations work on long-term timescales that do not fit with those of a two-year research project. This has been an important lesson to learn within the project consortium, and future projects which seek to involve faith-based groups should incorporate this into planning and implementation measures, perhaps involving an organisation from the outset to enable a more

longitudinal engagement. Having said this, we are hoping to partially bridge this gap by engaging with a faith-based organisation in the UK during the final phase of the project.

#### *Staff changes and transferability*

Another note on the societal implications from ESDinds as a project relates to the changing nature of the team involved in the project. Personal circumstances and organisational changes have led to several changes in the membership of the Consortium over the last year and a half. Three individuals left the group, albeit one temporarily, four members joined and one member changed roles. Firstly, this means that more people have been directly involved in the project thus increasing the potential reach of the concepts driving the project and its outcomes. Second, the project has also built capacity within the research institutions and partner CSOs. Third, the project has had input from researchers and CSO members with diverse skills, adding to the richness of the project. Fourthly, these changes have not jeopardised the success of the project, and have rather strengthened it through ensuring transferability and collective understanding at every stage of the project.

#### *Towards a community of practice*

Building a community of practice involves bringing together people from all fields, academic and non-academic. A first step towards engaging the academic field has been the publication of a journal article in the special edition of the Journal of Education for Sustainable Development, co-authored by the research team and a CSO member (Podger *et al.* in press).

Furthermore, as the ESDinds project has been moving forward and evolving, the need for an event that would bring together workers in the different but overlapping fields of Indicators, Sustainability and Values became apparent. Benefits stemming from the highly interdisciplinary approach taken in the project are already emerging, and the Consortium partners felt that a conference would provide the space and opportunity for civil society, academics, businesses, international donors, governmental programmes, international foundations, faith-based organisations and more to report on activities and share ideas and experience. Originally a 3-day workshop had been planned, but with in-kind contributions by the University of Brighton it has been possible to upgrade that to an international conference, involving not only participants in ESDinds but workers in related fields. We envision the conference, not as the end of the ESDinds project, but a place where these exciting interactions will lead to an emerging Community of Practice in Indicators, Sustainability and Values. The conference is free to attend and we are also hoping to allow remote access and free access to recordings after the event, thus increasing the potential for people around the world and limited resources to take part.

(More information on the conference can be found on

<http://www.brighton.ac.uk/sdecu/research/esdinds/conference/index.html> )

## Social Implications and ESDinds field visits

The ESDinds project partners have successfully designed project-level indicators designed for values-based learning and behaviour change. The field visits were the locus for testing these evaluation tools and methods, and although designed as trials, several project evaluations were effectively carried out.

The experience of the field visits was essential in order to understand the complexities of different social contexts and ways in which this might influence the evaluation process. In this sense, the report presents lessons learnt from the influence of macro social processes such as national discourses or social norms, relationships between individuals within the project to be evaluated or the relationship between a CSO and their donor. Second, the evaluation exercises carried out in the field visits had varying social impacts. The importance and nature of project evaluation impacts are extensively covered in the social sciences academic literature (see Henry & Mark 2003) but drawing out these impacts was not the aim of the ESDinds project. However, after the first set of field visits, the Consortium realised that recording the impacts of the different evaluations would provide the project with a small but growing body of evidence for the indicators' usefulness and applicability at the project level as well as enable us to anticipate some of the wider social implications stemming from the use of values-based indicators.

### *Lessons learned*

One important lesson learnt during the field visits was the influence of national contexts and discourses. For instance, when initially presented with the indicators sorted into the five values chosen by the project partners (Justice, Integrity, Unity in Diversity, Empowerment, Respect and Care for the Community of Life), the director of Echeri Consultores chose to ignore all indicators associated with the value *empowerment* due to her perception of national discourse on empowerment and women, which she thought condescending for indigenous women. However, after having read through the indicators at a later stage, she found that these would have been relevant for the context of the projects evaluated if associated with a different value.

Another important observation in several field visits was that indicators that had initially been derived from a specific value were found by the CSO to be relevant to, and expressive of, multiple values. This demonstrated that the indicators provisionally associated with the six initial values (Justice, Empowerment, Integrity, Unity in Diversity, Trust and Care and Respect for the Community of Life) potentially have much wider applicability than the project team initially thought. In later field visits, and in the 'We Value' web platform, a different approach was taken: CSOs were presented initially with the full list of indicators, and after measuring the indicators, invited to explore their *own* values and to reflect on the links between the indicators and their values. The potential utility of this approach is demonstrated by the fact that at least one nascent CSO has incorporated the ESDinds indicators into its business plan at start-up stage, helping the CSO to crystallise its own values and illustrating how the indicators will be used in monitoring and evaluation activities throughout the project.

The field visit carried out with the Sierra Leone Red Cross (SLRC) presented challenges in terms of gender equality for the evaluation process. The list of indicators developed contains gender-specific ones, and the absence of a woman who could speak both Sierra Leone Creole and English was limiting when addressing gender issues and splitting the group into two for example.

The project drew important lessons from these two instances. First, it is important to anticipate issues of gender inequality at a societal level that might impede women from taking on certain roles in organisations or create discourses around gender and development. This is especially important when the evaluation itself is best achieved through full participation of an organisation or project's members, and where individual and group perceptions, experiences and feelings are key. Second, the Consortium noted, at the third Core Group Meeting, that the presence of female research assistants and/or interpreters might be important for extracting information in the next field phase. Third, that the impact of linguistic and cultural differences and translation issues can potentially be reduced by presenting the values-based indicators without associating them with specific values in the first instance.

#### *Field visit impacts*

We have discovered that the use of the values-based indicators being developed in the ESDinds project has had an impact on certain individuals involved in the process of evaluation, influenced interpersonal interactions, collective actions and decision-making, both within the CSOs themselves and even in other, affiliated organisations. All of these levels of impact are interlinked and equally important: an impact on an individual can lead to interpersonal effects, which in turn may lead to future collective impacts (Henry & Mark 2003).

This section presents a few examples of the impacts that the evaluation process and results have had in four of the projects visited. A distinction is made between processes and findings, as the ESDinds project has identified that the way in which the evaluation was carried out, and the findings of the evaluation *per se*, both have important implications (this distinction is more or less easy to make, depending on the context). A list of the recorded outcomes and benefits of the evaluations carried out in the five first field visits can be found in Appendix 1.

#### People's Theatre

The evaluation carried out in the field visit gave People's Theater (PT) staff a practical way to see 'how values become visible', and to check on how people in the organisation are changing their values as a result of using the indicators with multiple evaluation methods. This led PT to change the nature of the preparation phase for new volunteers, centring it on values rather than themes related to acting or the performance itself. Although values were always important to PT, the project helped put them into focus and aided them to see each human being as 'full of values'.

Furthermore, results of the values-based evaluation showed that Justice was a very important value for both PT staff and volunteers, although it had not been included in PT's original list of core values. Taking this into account, it was decided that justice would be incorporated into the end-of-year evaluation for the youth in the summer.

Being able to measure values will also give schools more clarity about the work PT is doing, as PT volunteers will be able to state more clearly what happens (in terms of values) as a result of their performances, without necessarily having to show a full performance for every prospective new school in order to persuade them to join.

### Echeri Consultores

The field visit with Echeri Consultores (EC) in Mexico resulted in significant and unexpected impacts, some of which are presented here. The measurement and analysis of the indicator “Women feel that they are valued” helped make the youth conscious that the Juatarhu youth project generated a space of gender equity, in which (in contrast to national and regional norms) women and men have equal access to information and decision-making. The project director had been working consciously to create this space of equity, but had not made it explicit.

The participative way in which creative assessment tools were developed during the field visit empowered the organisation as well as the youth in the Juatarhu project to continue using the ESDinds indicators beyond the field visit. For instance, youth participants used some of the ESDinds Unity in Diversity assessment exercises as ‘ice-breaker’ activities (integration games) for other youth at national workshop hosted by Reforestamos Mexico (Echeri Consultores’ major donor).

Furthermore, the director of EC used the indicators and assessment tools developed during the field visit to evaluate an Environmental Education project carried out in schools across the region; using the spatial and corporal surveys instead of questionnaires saved paper and time, as well as being more dynamic and participatory for the children. The results of this evaluation also strengthened the organisation’s relationships with participating schools by enabling it to demonstrate clearly to headmasters that the work has pedagogical impact (beyond the actual trees planted) and helps the children to develop their values, whereas personal investment from headmasters was previously a major challenge.

Finally, the results from the evaluations carried out using the methodology developed through the ESDinds project were incorporated into Echeri Consultores’ annual report. This led the organisation’s major donor, Reforestamos Mexico (RM), to recognise the international relevance of the work done by EC and to explore the possibility of creating a tailor-made values-based indicator system to be used at the national level.

### Youth as Agents of Behavioural Change, Sierra Leone Red Cross

During this field visit, the measurement and analysis of the indicators, ‘Entities act in a manner that is impartial and non-discriminatory’ and ‘Women believe they are valued’ in particular, demonstrated that youth experience significantly less discrimination in the RC project teams than in their villages and opened discussions about gender equality that might be beneficial for the future of the project. The use of the ESDinds indicators and creative assessment tools also inspired the national-level youth coordinator for the Sierra Leone Red Cross to implement them in the future.

### Environmental Institutional Programme of Guanajuato University (PIMAUG)

Two field visits were carried out at the University of Guanajuato, as the Consortium agreed that the first visit was short and a second visit would allow us to test whether the indicators could be scaled up to be used in a project at the institutional level.

During the first visit, simply reading the indicators provided the project director and other members of the group with information and ideas on how to improve processes within the university environmental programme, for example by creating confidential channels for reporting violations of ethics. In the subsequent field visit, the project members were successfully empowered to use the indicators and assessment tools explored during the first field visit on a greater scale, by developing a values survey based on the ESDinds indicators to be delivered to all the administrative and academic coordinators of the university's Environmental Management System, as well as to the network of key environmental influencers and decision-makers in the institution. The indicators and participatory assessment tools were also incorporated into the core activity of their peer education project.

The potential impact of scaling up the application of values-based indicators to an educational institution is significant. By involving administrators, teaching staff and key decision-makers, the importance of values at the University of Guanajuato will be apparent not only for those who take part in the PIMAUG, but might create an institution-wide awareness and recognition of the importance of values in education for sustainable development and equip future citizens with that vision.

## References:

- EBBF annual report (2009) European Bahá'í Business Forum Annual Report. Available online at: [http://ebbf.org/fileadmin/pdfs/EBBF\\_Annual\\_Report\\_2009.pdf](http://ebbf.org/fileadmin/pdfs/EBBF_Annual_Report_2009.pdf) (accessed on 15 September 2010).
- ECI annual report (2009) Earth Charter Initiative Annual Report. Earth Charter International Secretariat: San Jose, Costa Rica. Available online at: <http://www.earthcharterinaction.org/download/Annual%20report%20OK%202009%20%28tabla%29.pdf> (accessed on 15 September 2010).
- Harder, M.K. (2009a) Sustainable Development – a Challenge for European Research. Paper presented at: *The Need for Better Design of Research Projects with Civil Society Organisation Partners*. Brussels: European Commission, ERA, 26-28 May 2009.
- Harder, M.K. (2009b) The Emergence of Design as a Necessity for Sustainable Development. Paper presented at: All Our Futures 2: Sustainable Design Conference. Sustainable Futures, Plymouth, September 2009
- Henry, G.T. & Mark, M.M (2003) Beyond Use: Understanding Evaluation's Influence on Attitudes and Actions. *American Journal of Evaluation* **24**: 293-314.
- Podger, D. *et al.* (2010) The Earth Charter and the ESDinds Initiative: Developing Indicators and Assessment Tools for Civil Society Organizations to Examine the Value and Dimensions of Sustainability Projects. *Journal of Education for Sustainable Development* **4**(2): 297-305.

## **Appendix 1**

Summary of insights into benefits and outcomes recorded from five different field visits

### **Summary of Themes**

#### **Theme 1: Benefits of the ESDinds process within the CSO itself**

- 1A:** Facilitator's personal understanding of participants
- 1B:** Participants' self-awareness and skills
- 1C:** Facilitators' self-awareness and skills
- 1D:** Identifying outcomes and impacts of existing project(s)
- 1E:** Confirming that current methodologies are adequate and appropriate
- 1F:** Identifying ways to improve existing project(s)
- 1G:** Changing the ways in which projects or activities are evaluated
- 1H:** Strategic planning (prioritising activities, or creating new ones)

#### **Theme 2: ESDinds in the context of the CSO's relationships with external donor organisations**

- 2A:** CSO's ability to report to donors on project outcomes and impacts
- 2B:** CSO's ability to provide donors with replicable examples of good practice
- 2C:** Donor's increased recognition for significance of CSO's work
- 2D:** Donor's own internal strategic planning
- 2E:** Donor's ability to influence policy at higher levels

#### **Theme 3: ESDinds in the context of the CSO's relationships with project beneficiaries and the general public**

- 3A:** CSO's ability to report back to current beneficiaries on project outcomes and impacts
- 3B:** CSO's ability to recruit new participants or partner organisations

## **Theme 1: Benefits of the ESDinds process within the CSO itself**

### **1A. Facilitator’s personal understanding of participants**

<b>Organisation</b>	<b>Benefit or Outcome</b>	<b>Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit</b>
Earth Charter Initiative (e-GLO)	Facilitator gained an increased awareness that a problem existed with participants following through on their commitments, i.e. completing homework tasks, although the reasons for this have not been fully identified.	Measurement and analysis, specifically of the indicator ‘Participants follow through on their commitments’: I_H2
Echeri Consultores	Facilitator gained deeper insight into the young people’s awareness of themselves, of one another and of the community, and of their connection with the environment; their motivation and consciousness.	Started with values crystallisation exercise, but was increased further through measurement and analysis.
	Facilitator could assess how each individual was positioned within the group - useful in clarifying why individuals might be struggling in certain areas, or experiencing problems, and identifying ways to help them.	Measurement and analysis – specifically, results of the spatial survey and qualitative information obtained in follow-up focus group.
	Facilitator gained clearer understanding of the extent to which school pupils had assimilated the values that were promoted as a core goal of their project.	Measurement and analysis, particularly quantitative aspects (numerical data from spatial surveys and theatrical comprehension tests with 1,500 pupils).
People’s Theater	Facilitators found it useful to compare the structured observation and self-assessment, as it created opportunities for dialogue with the youth - ‘what you see’ vs. ‘what we see’ – and provided a tool to help them in accompanying and supporting the youth. In one specific example, they encouraged a participant to share his ideas during the rehearsal.	Measurement and analysis, specifically the structured observation and self-assessment with individual follow-up interview.

### **1B. Participants’ self-awareness and skills**

<b>Organisation</b>	<b>Benefit or Outcome</b>	<b>Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit</b>
Echeri Consultores	The youth publicly expressed a view that by “making values visible”, the project had helped them to understand one another better and to value their activities much more. They’ve always felt very united, but ESDinds has helped them to know <u>why</u> they’re united.	Started with values crystallisation exercise, but was increased further through measurement, analysis, personal reflection and follow-up discussions.
	Talking about values and using the indicators drew	Measurement and analysis –

	<p>the youth participants' attention to aspects of the group's work that needed improvement. This was reflected in renewed commitment to respecting the norms that they had set for themselves, which in turn transformed the group relationship and greatly enhanced CSO's functioning.</p>	<p>specifically focusing on the indicator 'People follow the group norms': U_SH2e(ii).</p>
	<p>The ESDinds process helped certain individuals to participate more fully in the group, relate better to others, gain increased clarity and focus, and develop leadership skills.</p>	<p>Unclear at what stage(s) this took place and why. May have been a result of the general 'positive feeling' in the group created by the act of sharing something that resonated with everyone, or an aspect of the value selection exercise itself, but probably also related to the measurement and analysis. Interviews with youth would be helpful, especially those identified by the facilitator as having changed significantly as a result of the process.</p>
Echeri Consultores	<p>Youth became conscious that the project has generated a space of gender equity, in which (in contrast to national and regional norms) women and men have equal access to information and decision-making. The project director had been working consciously to create this space of equity, but had not made it explicit.</p>	<p>Measurement and analysis, specifically the indicator "Women feel that they are valued" (U_SH2f), to which the additional phrase "and have equal access to information and decision-making" was added during the field visit. The process of assessment via the spatial survey was important, in that every member of the group moved quickly and without hesitation to the area representing 'Very much', providing an additional emphasis.</p>
	<p>Youth (and facilitators) achieved a greater clarity that the end objective is the autonomy of the group and that "one day Juatarhu will be its own organisation, without relying on adults always to be there."</p>	<p>Measurement and analysis. This insight was gained from the youth's responses to the ESDinds exercises.</p>
People's Theater	<p>Youth appreciated the exercises very much, especially the opportunities for individual discussion. They found the discussions really encouraging, and came up with their own ideas about how they think they can improve in certain areas – identifying aspects of their behaviour that they have to work on, and 'gaps' between themselves and facilitators.</p>	<p>Measurement and analysis, specifically the individual follow-up interviews after the structured observation and self-assessment.</p>
	<p>Youth became more conscious of how they treat</p>	<p>Measurement and analysis,</p>

	one another and how they interact, rather than focusing only on 'having a good rehearsal' or 'getting a good result'.	specifically the individual follow-up interviews after the structured observation and self-assessment.
	Youth became more self-confident as a result of learning how they were viewed by a consensus of three observers, one of them an external observer who did not previously know them well.	Measurement and analysis, specifically the individual follow-up interviews after the structured observation and self-assessment.

### 1C. Facilitators' self-awareness and skills

Organisation	Benefit or Outcome	Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit
Echeri Consultores	Facilitators felt encouraged by feedback from the youth on issues such as whether they (the youth) felt that their points of view were heard and incorporated (by the facilitators): "The feedback was about <u>us</u> , whether we actually did that... It's not something out there, external. It gives us a place, encourages us, respects our identity... "	Measurement and analysis of indicators, especially those relating to relationships between youth and facilitators

### 1D. Identifying outcomes and impacts of existing project(s)

Organisation	Benefit or Outcome	Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit
Earth Charter (e-GLO)	CSO learned that its distance learning course, e-GLO ( <u>not</u> ESDinds) had helped a participant to clarify his/her own values.	Measurement and analysis, particularly the question 'Did you find any of the e-GLO sessions controversial with your own values?' (evidence for U_H1)
Echeri Consultores	Through the ESDinds analysis, it was discovered that one of the schools previously categorised as a 'model school' was performing less well than expected, and had in fact been one of the least engaged in the process.	Measurement and analysis, particularly the results of structured observation of tree nurseries
	One of the tree nurseries was moved to a different school as a result of ESDinds findings.	Measurement and analysis, particularly structured observation of tree nurseries
People's Theater	The field visit showed PT staff that it's possible to improve certain points and that if the measurement is done more often, they can witness the improvement of the youth in certain areas. It has given them a practical way to see 'how values become visible', and to check on how people in the organisation are changing their values.	Measurement and analysis

### 1E. Confirming that current methodologies/strategies are adequate and appropriate

Organisation	Benefit or Outcome	Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit
Earth Charter Initiative (e-GLO)	CSO learned that despite the cultural diversity of the e-GLO course, the participants had not felt that their personal values were compromised by participating, and one commented that the values promoted in the e-GLO were 'very universal'. This provided a useful confirmation for the CSO that the value content of the course resonated with people from diverse backgrounds and didn't need to be modified.	Measurement and analysis, particularly the question 'Did you find any of the e-GLO sessions controversial with your own values?' (evidence for U_H1)
Echeri Consultores	CSO director felt that she had received confirmation of the overall validity of her methodology, above and beyond the concrete results that were achieved.	Overall measurement and analysis
Sierra Leone Red Cross	Findings demonstrated clearly that youth experience significantly ( $p < 0.05$ ) less discrimination in the RC project teams than in their villages.	Measurement and analysis, particularly of the indicator 'Entities act in a manner that is impartial and non-discriminatory' (J_SH1c)
	Results of the assessment indicated that women believe they are valued. The discussion and nuances opened up by the ESDinds methods may have been beneficial for the CSO (researcher's perception).	Measurement and analysis, particularly of the indicator 'Women believe they are valued' (U_SH2f)

### 1F. Identifying ways to improve existing project(s)

Organisation	Benefit or Outcome	Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit
Earth Charter Initiative (e-GLO)	CSO director noted that group norms were evident for only half of participants, which implies that they were not made sufficiently explicit and not clarified. She acknowledged that in the future, the group norms should be made more evident in each session.	Measurement and analysis, specifically of the indicator 'Group norms exist': U_SH2e(i)
	Recruiting women for the course was identified as a weakness, and CSO director has acknowledged the need to modify recruitment procedures in order to improve the proportion of women.	Measurement and analysis, specifically of the indicator 'Teams include members with different characteristics (e.g. gender)'; U_H2(ii)
Echeri Consultores	Criteria for categorisation of schools as 'model', 'control' or 'comparison' schools were changed after ESDinds. CSO director realised that earlier categorisation of schools had been based on more superficial aspects, and that the missing aspect	Measurement and analysis, specifically observation of tree nurseries in the context of other value indicators tested in schools

	was the values, which in turn influence the commitment and energy of staff and pupils.	
	Procedures for restructuring the youth group were changed after ESDinds. Group leaders had previously been selected on the basis of competences and capacities that are immediately evident, but after the values assessment, decisions were taken on the basis of how they positioned themselves within the group.	Measurement and analysis, especially spatial survey and follow-up focus group.
	CSO could compare findings between schools to identify and address the key factors differentiating schools where values were well assimilated, and those where the program was less successful in that respect.	Measurement and analysis, particularly quantitative aspects (numerical data from spatial surveys and theatrical comprehension tests with 1,500 pupils).
Echeri Consultores	The Juatarhu leadership was changed after discussions about the ESDinds process and its findings. One of the youngest members was appointed as overall leader, after her “commitment, respect, love, friendship” and “very soft leadership style” became apparent during the ESDinds exercises.	Unclear to what extent these conclusions were based on the individual’s participation in the process, versus the findings of the exercises (i.e. how she moved during the spatial survey, what she said during the focus group, etc). Cardiela may be able to clarify this.
Guanajuato University	Reading the indicators provided the project director and other members of the group with information and ideas on how to improve processes within the CSO (university environmental programme), e.g. by creating confidential channels for reporting violations of ethics.	Reading and discussing indicators ( <u>prior</u> to measurement), especially the indicator ‘Truth-seeking, non-judgemental, confidential channels...’ (I_SH1i).
People’s Theater	After the first phase field visit, the preparation phase for new volunteers was changed to centre around values, rather than themes related to acting or the performance itself. Although values were always important to PT, the project helped to put them into focus and aided them to see each human being as ‘full of values’.	Values crystallisation exercise; <u>prior</u> to measurement of the indicators. CSO made changes to its methodology after first phase field visit.
	Justice was ranked as a very important value by both staff and volunteers, although it had not been included in PT’s original list of core values. Taking this into account, justice will be incorporated into the end-of-year evaluation for the youth in the summer.	Values crystallisation exercise; <u>prior</u> to measurement of the indicators. CSO intends to change its strategy, although facilitators have not yet worked out all the details.

### 1G. Changing the ways in which projects or activities are evaluated

Organisation	Benefit or Outcome	Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit
--------------	--------------------	--

Echeri Consultores	Evaluation strategy for Juatarhu (previously based only on the observed results of activities) has been enhanced by including ESDinds indicators that can provide clear and specific information on the “human results” of the group’s activities, i.e. the individual processes of each group member in relation to the broader vision.	Overall measurement and analysis. CSO has continued to use ESDinds strategies after the field visit.
	Evaluation strategy for schools programme was transformed by incorporating ESDinds assessment tools. Previously, two-page questionnaires had to be prepared and answered by every child. Using the spatial and corporal surveys saved paper and time, as well as being more dynamic and participatory.	Creative assessment tools (spatial & corporal survey). CSO has continued to use these tools after the field visit.
Guanajuato University	Facilitators were excited by the spatial and corporal surveys as an assessment tool, and intend to use them in future workshops.	Creative assessment tools (spatial & corporal survey).
People’s Theater	Evaluation strategy was changed after ESDinds. Previously, the youth had only been asked to fill out a questionnaire about motivation, but when ESDinds methodology was used instead, the conversations ‘became much deeper’ and the evaluation had a greater impact than before. Facilitators felt that giving feedback based on specific, observable criteria makes the evaluation more structured and objective.	Measurement and analysis, specifically the structured observation and self-assessment with individual follow-up interview.
	The spatial survey and corporal survey were felt to be very useful tools for evaluating PT’s performances in schools. Previously, the children were given a questionnaire, but project volunteers had observed that younger children did not understand the questionnaires and often wrote down things that were irrelevant to the questions. PT staff found the Echeri approach very inspiring.	Creative assessment tools (spatial & corporal survey)
Sierra Leone Red Cross	CSO staff, especially national-level youth coordinator, found the methodologies for facilitation (i.e. assessment tools) very useful and may implement them in the future.	Creative assessment tools (spatial and corporal survey)

#### 1H. Strategic planning (prioritising existing activities, or creating new ones)

Organisation	Benefit or Outcome	Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit
Echeri Consultores	ESDinds assisted CSO to prioritise activities (in the context of time and budget constraints) by focusing on those with the highest impact on themselves, their communities and their ecosystem, on the	Overall measurement and analysis

	basis of information provided by the indicators.	
--	--	--

## **Theme 2: CSO's relationships with external donor organisations**

### **2A. CSO's ability to report to donors on project outcomes and impacts**

<b>Organisation</b>	<b>Benefit or Outcome</b>	<b>Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit</b>
Echeri Consultores, Reforestamos Mexico	The results from the ESDinds assessment, particularly the quantitative data, were incorporated into CSO's annual report to its major donor, Reforestamos Mexico, and provided a way to demonstrate the scale of its achievements.	Measurement and analysis, particularly quantitative aspects (numerical data from spatial surveys and theatrical comprehension tests with 1,500 pupils).

### **2B. CSO's ability to provide donors with replicable examples of good practice**

<b>Organisations</b>	<b>Benefit or Outcome</b>	<b>Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit</b>
Echeri Consultores, Reforestamos Mexico	Participants used some of the ESDinds Unity in Diversity assessment exercises as 'ice-breaker' activities (integration games) for other youth at RM-hosted national workshop.	Measurement, but in this case the focus was more on using the indicators as a communication tool to help people get to know each other, rather than to measure values as such. No analysis was done; results may not have been recorded.

### **2C. Donor's increased recognition for significance of CSO's work**

<b>Organisations</b>	<b>Benefit or Outcome</b>	<b>Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit</b>
Echeri Consultores, Reforestamos Mexico	As a result of the ESDinds process, Reforestamos Mexico has reconceptualised the work of Echeri as something of <u>international</u> relevance, no longer just a local project. This is of critical importance to the future of the CSO in a highly competitive funding climate, in which RM is cutting projects.	Unclear what specifically impressed them – the processes used by the Juatarhu youth at the national workshop, the Echeri report presenting the results and analysis from Juatarhu and the schools programme, the RM board's discussions with Ismael and Cardiela in Mexico City? Most likely a combination of the above.
	At the national workshop, the National Youth Council of Reforestamos Mexico was elected, and five out of the 11 youth were chosen from Echeri's Juatarhu youth group.	Unclear to what extent this was a direct benefit of ESDinds. Undoubtedly the 'ice-breaker' activities run by the Juatarhu youth during this workshop had some influence, but no way of knowing whether they would still have been elected anyway.

## 2D. Donor's own internal strategic planning

Organisations	Benefit or Outcome	Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit
Echeri Consultores, Reforestamos Mexico	RM itself is interested in creating a tailor-made indicator system to be used at the national level.	Unclear what specifically impressed them – the processes used by the Juatarhu youth at the national workshop, the Echeri report presenting the results and analysis from Juatarhu and the schools programme, the RM board's discussions with Ismael and Cardiela in Mexico City? Most likely a combination of the above.
Echeri Consultores, Reforestamos Mexico	At a subsequent meeting of the whole national youth network of Reforestamos Mexico, the Juatarhu youth made a contribution directly to the national strategy, based on the findings from indicators. The process helped them to “identify values in action” and to gain clarity about the type of actions that are most effective in reinforcing the value of Respect and Care for the Community of Life.	Measurement and analysis.

## 2E. Donor's ability to influence policy at higher levels

Organisations	Benefit or Outcome	Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit
Echeri Consultores, Reforestamos Mexico	RM has a key role in shaping the public and government National Environmental Agenda. Since they have prioritised two Echeri projects (partly or largely due to ESDinds?), Echeri now has an opportunity to influence the national agenda and shape public policy.	Unclear exactly how ESDinds relates to national agenda at present.

**Theme 3: CSO's relationships with project beneficiaries and the general public**

**3A. CSO's ability to report back to current beneficiaries on project outcomes and impacts**

<b>Organisations</b>	<b>Benefit or Outcome</b>	<b>Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit</b>
Echeri Consultores, participating schools	The ESDinds process has strengthened the CSO's relationships with participating schools by enabling it to demonstrate clearly to headmasters that its work has pedagogical impact (beyond the actual trees planted) and helps the children to develop their values. Personal investment from headmasters was previously a major challenge.	Measurement and analysis, particularly quantitative aspects (numerical data from spatial surveys and theatrical comprehension tests with 1,500 pupils).

**3B. CSO's ability to recruit new participants or partner organisations**

<b>Organisations</b>	<b>Benefit or Outcome</b>	<b>Specific aspects of ESDinds that generated the benefit</b>
People's Theater	Being able to measure values will give schools more clarity about the work of PT, as PT volunteers will be able to state more clearly what happens (in terms of values) as a result of its performances, without necessarily having to show a full performance as an example for every prospective new school in order to persuade them to join.	Measurement and analysis
	Schools like the fact that PT is a partner in an EU-funded program (i.e. it gives PT greater credibility)	Simple fact of participation in ESDinds (i.e. commitment from the proposal stage; prior to measurement of indicators)